

Tuesday, September 29

Venue: Conference Room 404

Cross-cultural and Cross-religious Encounters in Historical Context

This session comprises two parts - the morning session, organized by scholars of Ethics and Western Philosophy, mainly brings to light the early-modern evangelical activities of the Jesuit Order in East Asia, while the scholars from Indology and Buddhist Studies organize the afternoon session concerning the religio-philosophical perspective in cultural diversity in pre-modern India.

Session Organizers: Taisei Shida, Chizuko Yoshimizu, and Naoki Kuwabara

Part One	Chair: Naoki Kuwabara, University of Tsukuba	
9:10-9:40	Kenichi Nejime The Japan's Christian Century and the Italian Renaissance: From the Point of View of the Immortality of the Soul	Professor, Gakushuin Women's College
9:40-10:10	Yoshitsugu Igawa The Understanding of the Soul Theory in China by the Jesuits of the 17 th Century : Mainly on Translation of The Doctrine of the Mean (『中庸』) in Confucius Sinarum Philosophus	Professor, University of Tsukuba
10:10-10:40	Patrick Schwemmer A Bicultural, Bilingual Theatrical Exchange between the Tenshō Boys' Embassy and the Kyūshū Collegio	Sophia University / Princeton University
10:40-11:10	Noriaki Takaishi Intellect and Will: A Comparative Study of Thomas Aquinas and Pedro Gomez	Doctoral Candidate, University of Tsukuba
11:10-11:40	Ryuta Ishida How to Use the Writings of Saint Thomas Aquinas: On Pedro Gómez's <i>Compendium</i> , Part 2	Doctoral Candidate, University of Tsukuba
11:40-12:00	Comments and Floor Discussion	
Part Two	Chair: Ernest Brewster, Harvard University	
13:20-13:50	Akihiko Akamatsu Doxography and Perspectivism in Pre-Modern India	Professor, Kyoto University
13:50-14:20	Taisei Shida The Exegetic School's Dialogical Strategy for the Authorization of Scripture in Classical India	Associate Professor, University of Tsukuba
14:20-14:50	Harunaga Isaacson Verses by Buddhist Authors and Verses with Allusions to Buddhism in Two Post-1200 AD Anthologies of Sanskrit Verses	Professor, Hamburg University / University of Tsukuba
14:50-15:20	Alexis Sanderson The Tantric Rebirth of Indian Buddhism under Śākta-Śaiva Influence during the 7th to 11th Centuries	Professor, Oxford University
15:40-16:10	Comments and Floor Discussion	

The Japan's Christian Century and the Italian Renaissance: From the Point of View of the Immortality of the Soul

Kenichi Nejime

Gakushuin Women's College, Tokyo

Christianity was introduced in Japan by the Jesuit Francis Xavier, a graduate of Paris, in 1549. This marked the beginning of its Christian era, which lasted until the mid-seventeenth century. Xavier and his followers did not only bring the doctrines of the Catholic Church to the country. They also brought the customs and culture of the West. Its major intellectual components of the time were three kinds, traditional Aristotelianism, two new trends, both humanism and Platonism. The introduction of humanism and the revival of Platonism, which began in Florence and other Italian cities, are known to have exerted a considerable impact on European culture. Upon his arrival, Xavier was struck to learn that the local Buddhist monks denied the possibility of life after death. For his evangelical activity, Xavier opted to emphasize the doctrine of the immortality of the soul. The Jesuits who followed him continued to work in this direction. The doctrine has had profound relation to the theory of the Platonism. And then it was determined for the first time as the article of faith at the Fifth Lateran Council (1513). Several important studies have shown that Europe saw lively debates on the doctrine of the immortality of the soul among religious orders and leading philosophers during the Renaissance. Disputes on the same issue between the Jesuits and the Japanese Buddhists show a striking parallel. Thirty years after Xavier, another Jesuit and a law graduate of Padua, Alessandro Valignano, came to Japan and founded a Jesuit college where the *studia humanitatis* would be taught to local students. Here Valignano, as a Renaissance man, knew the importance of the humanism as well as of the Aristotelianism and of the Platonism. This paper will thus address the religious and cultural encounters between the West and Japan in the early Modern Age.

The Understanding of the Soul Theory in China by the Jesuits of the 17th Century: Mainly on Translation of The Doctrine of the Mean (『中庸』) in Confucius Sinarum Philosophus

Yoshitsugu Igawa

*Doctoral Program in Philosophy, Graduate School of Humanities and Social Sciences,
University of Tsukuba*

Chinese study book *Confucius Sinarum Philosophus* (1687), that received the publication support from Louis 14th, introduced the first philosophical information on the soul of China to Europe. Authors, Philip Couplet and Prospero Intorcetta believed that there was affinity between Chinese philosophy and the Christian doctrine. They depended on cultural accommodation policy of Matteo Ricci and profoundly studied Chinese classics. In addition, they chose the commentaries which supported their opinions carefully. Missionaries widely adopted his interpretation for understanding and the translation of the classical Chinese original texts, though they criticized the commentary of Zhu Xi (朱熹) who rationalized excessively to explain everything. They recommended a commentary of Zhang Ju-zheng (張居正), who was in a leadership position in politics and education, as favorable interpretation. It was because the peculiar role of the divinity and the spiritual entia was found by Zhang Ju-zheng's commentary. Missionaries' understanding about the spiritual entia indicated on a classic of Confucianism, *The Doctrine of the Mean* is examined in this presentation. They insisted that the Chinese representative documents had concepts similar to spiritual entia in Christianity. It seems that missionaries tried to explain through such information the results of the China propagation, and to insist China could be Christianized. On the other hand, there is a thought frame concerning the correlation between the universe and human being, everything and human being which assume Ratio (Li, 理) intermediation in *The Doctrine of the Mean* (Zhongyong, 『中庸』). Such worldview is going to be introduced to Europe at the same time through translation. The Chinese soul theory was introduced with a background of such a cosmology. There might have been a person who had paid attention to such a cosmology in the readers. I collate and examine the fact of such an information with the classical Chinese original texts, various commentaries, and Latin translations.

A Bicultural, Bilingual Theatrical Exchange between the Tenshō Boys' Embassy and the Kyūshū Collegio

Patrick Schwemmer

Department of Japanese Literature, Sophia University

The Jesuit order is well known for its educational use of theatre and other performing arts, and its activities in sixteenth-century Japan were no exception. However, Japanese Jesuit theatre underwent various changes over the course of the sixteenth century in response to pressures both internal and external. In the first twenty years of the mission (ca. 1550–1570), everyday parishioners of the churches of Kyūshū were encouraged to produce and perform songs, dances, and plays based on biblical and other legends, and the ceremonial presentation of such pieces before local lords was an important part of the Jesuit strategy to accomplish and then reward their conversions to Christianity. However, the 1570s saw growing opposition to the use of performing arts in a missionary context, and when the new Visitor Valignano arrived in Japan in 1579, an official statement from the Superior General in Rome all but prohibited performances involving lay brothers, in Japanese, or in churches. However, although Valignano and his subordinates at least stop reporting local performances of Christian drama, they nevertheless make musical, choral, and dramatic instruction in Latin a focus in education of young Japanese in the new Collegio. Meanwhile, Valignano himself was busy parading four such youths around Europe, where, in addition to meeting kings and popes, they studied European instrumental and choral music and took part in ceremonial plays dramatizing their own journey in the context of world history as the Jesuits conceived it. Thus, in 1590, upon the young ambassadors' return to Japan, the stage was set for an exchange of concerts, plays, and dances, sponsored by Arima Harunobu, between the ambassadors and the students of the Collegio who had been studying the same arts in Kyūshū. In this presentation, I introduce this event from previously-undiscussed original documents.

Intellect and Will: A Comparative Study of Thomas Aquinas and Pedro Gomez

Noriaki Takaishi

The purpose of this presentation is to compare the thinking of Saint Thomas Aquinas, the 13th century theologian, and Pedro Gomez, a 16th century Jesuit, on intellect and will. The ethical thinking of Gomez is based on that of Aquinas, but there are not a few differences between them. One of the differences is their ideas about which is more primary for human acts, intellect or will. This question has been discussed by many thinkers for a long time. Aquinas counts generally among intellectualists. This understanding is incorrect inasmuch as the cardinal element of his thinking is love, which is an activity of will. But he is indeed an intellectualist in that he is quite different from the voluntarists, who rose to prominence after him. On the other hand, a voluntarist tendency is found in the thinking of Gomez. He lays stress on the power of the will where Aquinas instead focuses on the activity of the intellect. Generally speaking, Gomez is not a voluntarist. However, compared with Aquinas, he can be called one. Since Gomez discusses human acts in more or less the same way as Aquinas, their thinking is easy to compare. Therefore, I will inquire into the intellect and will behind human acts by comparing these thinkers.

How to Use the Writings of Saint Thomas Aquinas: On Pedro Gómez's *Compendium*, Part 2

Ryuta Ishida

*Doctoral Program in Philosophy, Graduate School of Humanities and Social Sciences,
University of Tsukuba / Japan Society for the Promotion of Science*

In *Ratio studiorum* (first drafted in 1586 and completed in 1599), the teachings of Saint Thomas Aquinas (c.1224—74) are regarded as one of the most important curriculums in Jesuit schools. His *Summa theologiae* is one of the main texts used for teaching activities. In particular, there is a detailed plan to teach *Summa* at each grade in *The Rules for Professors of Scholastic Theology (Regulae professoris scholasticae theologiae)* of the 1599 version of *Ratio*. However, 1599 *Ratio* explicitly designates the *Summa* only as a work for use in education, and does not nominate any other writings of Aquinas as educational resources. By turning our eyes to Pedro Gómez's *Compendium*, written in 1593, and probably the first substantial textbook used for theology studies at the Jesuit Collegio in early modern Japan, we might notice a difference between the 1599 *Ratio* and *Compendium*. The *Compendium* also uses the doctrine of Thomas Aquinas as one of the most important sources from which students ought to learn. However, Part 2 of *Compendium* lists explicitly many other writings of Thomas Aquinas than *Summa theologiae*. The list includes *Summa contra gentiles* (another major work of Aquinas), *Quaestiones disputatae de potentia Dei* (a record of the disputed questions on the theme of the power of God), and one opuscle. Contrasting this with the 1599 *Ratio*, there is a variety of writings by Aquinas included, but why? By answering this question, my presentation will seek to evaluate the influence of the thought of Thomas Aquinas on Gómez's *Compendium*, Part 2, referring to every work by Aquinas used in *Compendium*. This will also provide us with one example of the use of the writings of Aquinas in the educational field.

Doxography and Perspectivism in Pre-Modern India

Akihiko Akamatsu

Department of Indological Studies, Graduate School of Letters, Kyoto University

Here, I am to bring to light the reflective consciousness held by the people of pre-modern India towards their own perspectives. When Aristotle spoke in *Metaphysics* about ‘those who first formed the systems of philosophy’, he was speaking of the beginnings of philosophy, and simultaneously, his discussion of these beginnings can itself be said to be the self-conscious beginning of academic ‘philosophy’. Therefore, it can be said that a philosophy that was directly linked with consciousness of a beginning was particularly recognized by the Greeks as a specific type of self-consciousness and a form of self-knowledge. If philosophy by this definition was, to the Greeks, the form of a particular knowledge, then it should be possible to treat the unique Indian argumentative style—one that relativizes its own perspective, despite lacking (or simply without having) a privileged consciousness of ‘beginning’—as a view on things unique to pre-modern India. Texts in this style bequeathed to us are by necessity introduced here as ‘doxographies’, although the term may be thought of as somewhat strange. If ‘historiography of philosophy’ is a genealogical description of the historical development of doctrines, as in Aristotle’s description of philosophy from its beginnings to Plato in Book I of *Metaphysics*, then ‘doxography’ is an approach that shows almost no interest in the historical spread and development of doctrines, but instead treats the doctrines of each school as closed, ahistorical systems and attempts to find a place for them amid contrasts between ways of thinking and viewpoints held by other parties. I aim first to introduce representative examples of such doxographies and to clarify the unique perspectives found within them. Then, I take up perspectives concerned with neutrality, paying special attention to perspectivism in Jainism as the background of the formation of such perspectives, and make use of the texts of Maillavādin (6th century) and of Yaśovijaya (17th century) to clarify these perspectives’ special characteristics.

The Exegetic School's Dialogical Strategy for the Authorization of Scripture in Classical India

Taisei Shida

Institute for Comparative Research in Human and Social Sciences, University of Tsukuba

Among diverse religio-philosophical traditions in classical India, almost all the schools each have their own scripture as a religious and social norm, and they authorize the validity of their scriptures in various ways. The school of logic (Nyāya), like the Buddhist logico-epistemic school, appeals to the omniscience and the integrity of the assumed author of their scriptures, such as God or Buddha, despite the risk of circular or regressive logical problems in the process of justification. Other schools authorize scripture by means of a negative assessment of human reasoning and experience. The Vedānta school, an extreme example, claims that what is revealed in the Veda is not to be verified but merely to be accepted, and that this acceptance is itself a gift of the Veda. One of the most conservative Brahmanical schools is Mīmāṃsā, whose main concern is the exegesis of the scriptures, i.e., the Veda. Mīmāṃsā uses an idiosyncratic strategy for the authorization of the Veda, claiming the eternity of each phoneme as a medium of verbal communication, as well as the non-artifactuality (i.e. authorlessness) of words and sentences which constitute the scriptures. This authorization is also based on another theory peculiar to the school: the “intrinsic validity” of any cognition or sentence. This presentation aims to show how and why these notions, such as the eternity of phonemes, the non-artifactuality of words and sentences, and intrinsic validity, support each other and converge in the authorization of the Veda. In particular, I will investigate the rationality of the argumentation and its applicability to trans-national societies outside an Indian context, focusing on how each Mīmāṃsā apologist selects interlocutors and constructs a dialogical philosophical treatise.

Verses by Buddhist Authors and Verses with Allusions to Buddhism in Two Post-1200 AD Anthologies of Sanskrit Verses

Harunaga Isaacson^{1,2}

¹University of Hamburg, ²University of Tsukuba

As a small contribution to the session “Cross-cultural and Cross-religious Encounters in Historical Context”, I shall survey Buddhist material and allusions to Buddhism in verses in two post-1200 AD anthologies of Sanskrit verses: the *Sūktimuktāvalī* compiled by Jalhaṇa in 1258 at the Yādava court in the Deccan, and the *Subhāṣitāvalī* compiled by a Vallabhadeva in Kashmir, dating (at least in the form available today) probably to the 15th century. Apart from an overview of the material it will be considered what light it sheds on the level of ‘popular’ (among Sanskrit readers at least) knowledge of Buddhist literature and Buddhist thought in a period after organized Buddhism had entirely or almost entirely disappeared in the regions concerned.

The Tantric Rebirth of Indian Buddhism under Śākta-Śaiva Influence during the 7th to 11th Centuries

Alexis Sanderson

*Spalding Professor of Eastern Religions and Ethics, University of Oxford, and
Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford*

In this paper I shall show how Tantric Buddhism developed by absorbing and adapting Śākta-Śaiva ritual methods, Yogic physiology, and post-initiatory ascetic practices. I shall consider the extent to which these fundamental changes should be seen as Buddhism's having lost its ability to resist assimilation by the dominant religious idioms of the age and the extent to which the same may be understood as the product of a conscious strategy of recruiting and converting outsiders by adapting and subverting the latter's non-Buddhist religious culture for Buddhist purposes. It will be concluded that there is no single simple answer to the question of how this profound change from the pre-Tantric Mahāyāna to its Tantric forms occurred. I will show that the development is far from being a steady progression, there being marked ups-and-downs that show the inadequacy of a single explanation in terms of permeability through weakness on the one hand and skillful manipulation for Buddhist purposes on the other; and I shall attempt to account for this unsteady trajectory, at least in part, in terms of the ebb and flow of the power of the state during the period under review. Finally, I shall propose that whatever the varied conditions under which esoteric Buddhism emerged and developed in India the whole process should be seen not as Buddhism in decline but as Buddhism undergoing a profound re-invigoration, one that empowered its successful transmission into inner Asia, China, Japan, and Southeast Asia.